# VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE TWELFTH PARLIAMENT OF SINGAPORE

## **First Session**

## FRIDAY, 17 FEBRUARY 2012

*No. 14* **1.30 pm** 89

#### PRESENT:

Mr SPEAKER (Mr MICHAEL PALMER (Punggol East)).

Mr ANG HIN KEE (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ANG WEI NENG (Jurong).

Mr BAEY YAM KENG (Tampines).

Mr CHAN CHUN SING (Tanjong Pagar), Acting Minister for Community Development, Youth and Sports and Minister of State, Ministry of Information, Communications and the Arts.

Mr CHEN SHOW MAO (Aljunied).

Dr CHIA SHI-LU (Tanjong Pagar).

Mrs LINA CHIAM (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr CHARLES CHONG (Joo Chiat), Deputy Speaker.

Mr CHRISTOPHER DE SOUZA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Ms FAIZAH JAMAL (Nominated Member).

Mr NICHOLAS FANG (Nominated Member).

Assoc. Prof. FATIMAH LATEEF (Marine Parade).

Mr ARTHUR FONG (West Coast).

Mr CEDRIC FOO CHEE KENG (Pioneer).

Mdm FOO MEE HAR (West Coast).

Ms GRACE FU HAI YIEN (Yuhua), Senior Minister of State, Ministry of Information,

Communications and the Arts and Ministry of the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr GAN KIM YONG (Chua Chu Kang), Minister for Health and Government Whip.

Mr GAN THIAM POH (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr GERALD GIAM YEAN SONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr GOH CHOK TONG (Marine Parade).

Mdm HALIMAH YACOB (Jurong), Minister of State, Ministry of Community Development, Youth and Sports.

Mr HAWAZI DAIPI (Sembawang), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Manpower.

Mr HENG CHEE HOW (Whampoa), Senior Minister of State, Prime Minister's Office and Deputy Leader of the House.

Mr HENG SWEE KEAT (Tampines), Minister for Education.

Mr HRI KUMAR NAIR (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr INDERJIT SINGH (Ang Mo Kio).

Ms INDRANEE RAJAH (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr INTAN AZURA MOKHTAR (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr S ISWARAN (West Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office, Second Minister for Home Affairs and Second Minister for Trade and Industry.

Dr JANIL PUTHUCHEARY (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr KHAW BOON WAN (Sembawang), Minister for National Development.

Dr AMY KHOR LEAN SUAN (Hong Kah North), Minister of State, Ministry of Health and Deputy Government Whip.

Ms JANICE KOH (Nominated Member).

Dr LAM PIN MIN (Sengkang West).

Er Dr LEE BEE WAH (Nee Soon).

Ms ELLEN LEE (Sembawang).

Mr LEE HSIEN LOONG (Ang Mo Kio), Prime Minister.

Mr LEE KUAN YEW (Tanjong Pagar).

Mr DESMOND LEE TI-SENG (Jurong).

Mr LEE YI SHYAN (East Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry and Ministry of National Development.

Mr LIANG ENG HWA (Holland-Bukit Timah).

Mr LAURENCE LIEN (Nominated Member).

Ms MARY LIEW (Nominated Member).

Mr LIM BIOW CHUAN (Mountbatten).

Mr LIM HNG KIANG (West Coast), Minister for Trade and Industry.

Mr RAYMOND LIM SIANG KEAT (East Coast).

Mr LIM SWEE SAY (East Coast), Minister, Prime Minister's Office.

Ms SYLVIA LIM (Aljunied).

Dr LIM WEE KIAK (Nee Soon).

Ms PENNY LOW (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr LOW THIA KHIANG (Aljunied).

Ms LOW YEN LING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr LUI TUCK YEW (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Transport and Second Minister for Foreign Affairs.

Mr MASAGOS ZULKIFLI B M M (Tampines), Minister of State, Ministry of Home Affairs and Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Mr MUHAMAD FAISAL ABDUL MANAP (Aljunied).

Assoc. Prof. Dr MUHAMMAD FAISHAL IBRAHIM (Nee Soon).

Dr LILY NEO (Tanjong Pagar).

Dr NG ENG HEN (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister for Defence and Leader of the House.

Ms IRENE NG PHEK HOONG (Tampines).

Mr DAVID ONG KIM HUAT (Jurong).

Mr ONG TENG KOON (Sembawang).

Ms DENISE PHUA LAY PENG (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr PRITAM SINGH (Aljunied).

Mr R DHINAKARAN (Nominated Member).

Mr SEAH KIAN PENG (Marine Parade), Deputy Speaker.

Mr SENG HAN THONG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr K SHANMUGAM (Nee Soon), Minister for Foreign Affairs and Minister for Law.

Ms SIM ANN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Education and Minister for Law.

Mr SITOH YIH PIN (Potong Pasir).

Mr SAM TAN CHIN SIONG (Radin Mas), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Foreign Affairs and Acting Minister for Community Development, Youth and Sports.

BG (NS) TAN CHUAN-JIN (Marine Parade), Minister of State, Ministry of National Development and Ministry of Manpower.

Asst. Prof. TAN KHENG BOON EUGENE (Nominated Member).

Ms JESSICA TAN SOON NEO (East Coast).

Ms TAN SU SHAN (Nominated Member).

Mr PATRICK TAY TECK GUAN (Nee Soon).

Mr TEO CHEE HEAN (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Deputy Prime Minister, Coordinating Minister for National Security and Minister for Home Affairs.

Dr TEO HO PIN (Bukit Panjang), Deputy Government Whip.

Mrs JOSEPHINE TEO (Bishan-Toa Payoh), Minister of State, Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Transport.

Mr TEO SER LUCK (Pasir Ris-Punggol), Minister of State, Ministry of Trade and Industry.

Mr TEO SIONG SENG (Nominated Member).

Mr THARMAN SHANMUGARATNAM (Jurong), Deputy Prime Minister, Minister for Finance and Minister for Manpower.

Ms TIN PEI LING (Marine Parade).

Mr EDWIN TONG CHUN FAI (Moulmein-Kallang).

Mr VIKRAM NAIR (Sembawang).

Dr VIVIAN BALAKRISHNAN (Holland-Bukit Timah), Minister for the Environment and Water Resources.

Mr WONG KAN SENG (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr LAWRENCE WONG (West Coast), Minister of State, Ministry of Defence and Ministry of Education.

Assoc. Prof. Dr YAACOB IBRAHIM (Moulmein-Kallang), Minister for Information, Communications and the Arts and Minister-in-charge of Muslim Affairs.

Mr ALEX YAM ZIMING (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEE JENN JONG (Non-Constituency Member).

Mr ALVIN YEO (Chua Chu Kang).

Mr YEO GUAT KWANG (Ang Mo Kio).

Mr ZAINAL SAPARI (Pasir Ris-Punggol).

Mr ZAINUDIN NORDIN (Bishan-Toa Payoh).

Mr ZAQY MOHAMAD (Chua Chu Kang).

### ABSENT:

Mr MAH BOW TAN (Tampines).

Dr MOHAMAD MALIKI BIN OSMAN (East Coast), Senior Parliamentary Secretary to the Minister for Defence and Minister for National Development.

\_\_\_\_\_

- Papers presented to Parliament and received by the Clerk of Parliament pursuant to Standing Order No. 31 (Presentation of Papers) and ordered to lie upon the Table:
  - 1.1 The Revenue and Expenditure Estimates for Financial Year 2012/2013 Presented on 17 February 2012 (Cmd. 2 of 2012).
  - 1.2 Statement of the Minister for Finance [Under Article 147(4)(a) of the Constitution] Presented on 17 February 2012 (Misc. 2 of 2012).
  - 1.3 Supplementary Estimates of Expenditure for the Financial Year 1<sup>st</sup> April 2011 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2012 – Presented on 17 February 2012 (Cmd. 3 of 2012).
  - 1.4 Road Traffic (Motor Vehicles, Driving Licences) (Amendment) Rules 2012 Presented on 17 February 2012 (S.L. 41 of 2012).
- 2 16 Questions for Oral Answer were answered during Question Time.
- 3 Announcement by Speaker Mr Speaker made the following communication to the House:-

"In a letter dated 16 February 2012, the Secretary-General of the Workers' Party informed me that Mr Yaw Shin Leong, Member of Parliament for Hougang, has been expelled from the Party with effect from 14 February 2012.

Article 46(2)(b) of the Constitution states that the seat of a Member of Parliament shall become vacant if he ceases to be a member of, or is expelled or resigns from, the political party for which he stood in the election.

Article 48(a) of the Constitution states that any question as to whether a Member of Parliament has vacated his seat "shall be determined by Parliament whose decision shall be final". Article 48 also contains a proviso which permits the practice of Parliament postponing its decision 'in order to allow for the taking or determination of any proceedings that may affect the decision.'

It is presently unknown whether Mr Yaw is appealing against the Workers' Party decision or is otherwise challenging his expulsion.

On the morning of 17 February 2012, the Clerk of Parliament wrote a letter to Mr Yaw asking him to inform her in writing by Friday, 24 February 2012 if he intends to appeal against or challenge the expulsion. This was the practice adopted by Parliament in 1993 in the case involving Mr Chiam See Tong.

The decision on the vacancy of Mr Yaw's seat in this House will be taken when his reply is received or after the expiry of the deadline given to him to reply."

- Civil List (Minister of State, Ministry of Finance) Motion made, and Question put Resolved, "That this Parliament, pursuant to section 7 of the Civil List and Pension Act (Chapter 44), resolves that the Schedule to that Act be varied by deleting the figures "\$4,267,500", "\$2,068,300" and "\$659,300" in the second column and substituting for them the figures "\$1,568,900", "\$2,762,300" and "\$550,000" respectively.".
- Budget Statement (Deputy Prime Minister and Minister for Finance) Motion made, and Question proposed, "That Parliament approves the financial policy of the Government for the financial year 1<sup>st</sup> April 2012 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2013."; Debate stood adjourned under Standing Order 89(1); to be resumed on Tuesday, 28 February 2012.

6 Adjournment – (Leader of the House) – Resolved, "That Parliament do now adjourn to Tuesday, 28 February 2012.".

Adjourned at 5.24 pm

MICHAEL PALMER Speaker

## MEMORANDUM

Mr Speaker will take the Chair again at 12 noon on Tuesday, 28 February 2012.